

# Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel

## Record of Meeting

Date: 5th March 2018

Present	Deputy J. M. Maçon, Chairman Deputy S. Y. Mézec, Vice-Chairman Deputy T. A. Vallois
Apologies	
Absent	
In attendance	Senator A.J.H Maclean, Minister for Treasury and Resources [item 3 only] Deputy A.E. Pryke, Assistant Minister for Education [item 3 only] Mr J. Donovan, Chief Education Officer [item 3 only] Ms C. Walwyn, Chief Operating Officer, Education [item 3 only] Mr S. Hayward, Director of Treasury Operations and Investments [item 3 only] Mr B. Bekhradnia, Panel Advisor, via conference call [item 4 only] Mr A. Harris, Scrutiny Officer

Ref Back	Agenda matter	Action
	<p><b>1. Record of Meetings</b></p> <p>The Panel noted and approved the records of the meetings held on 16th and 19th February 2018. The Chairman signed them accordingly.</p>	
Item 2 19/02/18	<p><b>2. Conflict of Interest</b></p> <p>No conflicts were declared by Panel members.</p>	
	<p><b>3. Tertiary Education: Student Finance Proposals - Public Hearing with Minister for Treasury and Resources and Assistant Minister for Education.</b></p> <p>The Panel received Senator A.J.H Maclean, Minister for Treasury and Resources, Deputy A.E. Pryke, Assistant Minister for Education, Mr J. Donovan, Chief Education Officer, Ms C. Walwyn, Chief Operating Officer, Education and Mr S. Hayward, Director of Treasury Operations and Investments for a public hearing in relation to the student finance proposals review. A recording was made so that a transcript could be produced.</p>	
Item 4 19/02/18	<p><b>4. Tertiary Education: Student Finance Proposals</b></p> <p>The Panel held a conference call with its advisor, Mr B. Bekhradnia, in order to discuss his report on the proposals. Mr. Bekhradnia briefed the Panel on the four main concerns that had been raised through his review, namely:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The proposals were the most expensive option and created a significant amount of deadweight</li> <li>• The proposals offered a disproportionate amount of support to the most wealthy</li> <li>• The figures used to model the proposals grossly underestimated the likely future demand from students</li> </ul>	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There was insufficient evidence to suggest that other options (including loan schemes) were considered in any detail</li> </ul> <p>Mr Bekhradnia then briefed the Panel on potential questions it might consider asking at the hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources and the Assistant Minister for Education. The Panel thanked Mr. Bekhradnia for his work on the review.</p> <p>The Panel requested the Officer to contact the Chief Statistician to see whether any relevant data existed in relation to the number of families contained in each of the income groups in the proposals.</p> <p>The Panel agreed that once it had held the public hearing with the Minister for Treasury and Resources and Assistant Minister for Education, it would begin to draft its report. The Officer advised that a heads of report would be drawn up for Panel approval. The Panel noted the timeline for producing its report and agreed to aim for publication during the week of 26th March 2018.</p>	AH  AH
<b>Item 5 19/02/18</b>	<p><b>5. Draft Criminal Procedure (Jersey) Law 201-</b></p> <p>The Panel received an update from Deputy S.Y. Mézec in relation to the work being undertaken by the Sub-Panel reviewing the Draft Criminal Procedure (Jersey) Law 201-.</p> <p>Deputy S.Y. Mézec explained that the Panel was due to bring forward an amendment to the law which sought to remove the concept of retrials. It was noted that this was due to be lodged imminently. It was also noted that the Minister for Home Affairs was due to bring forward amendments to the law as a result of the work of the Sub-Panel. The Sub-Panel was now working on its report which was intended to be presented the week prior to the debate in the second reading on 20th March.</p>	AH
<b>Item 1 01/03/18</b>	<p><b>6. Draft Sexual Offences (Jersey) Law 201-</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that its three amendments to the Draft Sexual Offences (Jersey) Law 201- (“the draft law”) had been sent for lodging, however there had been no confirmation as to whether they had been approved. The Officer advised that this would be followed up.</p> <p>The Panel noted that a question had been posed by another States Member as to whether male genital mutilation was considered when formulating the draft law. The Panel had questioned this and a response had been received from the Community and Constitutional Affairs Department. The Panel requested the Officer to reflect the discussions in its final report.</p> <p>The Panel agreed that it would proceed with its report on the draft law and approved the heads of report document.</p>	AH  AH  AH
<b>Item 7 19/02/18</b>	<p><b>7. Nursery Education Fund</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that no further information had been received from the Education Department in relation to the Nursery Education Fund. It was recalled that the Assistant Minister for Education would not be bringing a proposition to the States, as the Attorney General had advised that an order rescinding the means testing of the fund would be sufficient.</p>	

	In the absence of any further information, the Panel agreed to monitor the situation and would place emphasis on this issue within its legacy report.	<b>AH</b>
<b>Item 8 19/02/18</b>	<p><b>8. Care of Children in Jersey Review Panel</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that the Review Panel's last meeting had been cancelled due to the adverse weather. Its next meeting was due to take place on Wednesday 14th March.</p> <p>Deputy S.Y. Mézec explained that he was due to attend a learning exchange trip to Edinburgh as part of a delegation with the Chief Minister on Thursday 22nd March to Saturday 24th March.</p>	
<b>Item 10 19/02/18</b>	<p><b>9. Amendment to the Jersey Immigration Rules</b></p> <p>The Panel noted a response from the Constitutional and Community Affairs Department which outlined the number of people that would be affected by the changes to the Immigration Rules, and the associated administration costs.</p>	
	<p><b>10. P.38/2018 – Draft Explosives (Amendment) (Jersey) Law 201-</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that the proposition had been lodged by the Minister for Home Affairs for debate on 10th April 2018. The Panel agreed to draft a letter to the Chief Minister and Minister for Home Affairs expressing its dissatisfaction that the legislation had been brought forward without adequate time to conduct detailed scrutiny. The Panel also agreed that it would request that the legislation be withdrawn from proceedings on 10th April.</p>	<b>AH</b>
	<p><b>11. P.39/2018 – Draft Armed Forces (Offences and Jurisdiction) (Jersey) Law 2017 (Appointed Day) Act 201-</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that the proposition had been lodged by the Minister for Home Affairs for debate on 10th April 2018.</p>	
	<p><b>12. P.40/2018 – Draft Armed Forces (Vehicles and Roads – Amendments) (Jersey) Regulations 201-</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that the proposition had been lodged by the Minister for Home Affairs for debate on 10th April 2018.</p>	
	<p><b>13. Future Meetings</b></p> <p>The Panel noted that its next scheduled meeting was due to take place at 9:30am on Monday 19th March in the Le Capelain Room, States Building.</p>	